

グローバル状況下におけるダリト運動概観：ダリト文学/フェミニズム研究動向を中心に

2012年4月15日

2012年度第1回 FINDAS 研究会 栗屋

はじめに

“Some day historians and political theorists are likely to speak of the 1990s in India (as they now do of the 1960s in France) as a period of epochal change in politics, the arts, democracy itself.” Susie Tharu, Ravikumar 2009 への序から

ただし、Rege(2006)はすでに80年代から新たな動きをみる

新自由主義の浸透

マンダル報告をめぐるアンチ留保制度議論(1990～)、Women's Bill 論争(1996～)

1991年、アンベードカル(14/4/1891-6/12/1956)生誕100年(アンベードカル著作の諸言語への翻訳)

「ヒンドゥー・ナショナリズム」の拡散と変容(Cf. ダリト・パンサー創始者 Namdev Dhasal がシヴ・セナーに転向、シヴ・セナーのフレア、アンベードカルに取り込み、ex. Bhimshakti-Shivshakti スローガン、BSP の BJP との連立)

## 1. ダリト運動のグローバル化

\* 国際人権言説

National Campaign on Dalit Human Rights 1998.

→ International Dalit Solidarity Network(2000)

南アジア：インド、パキスタン、バングラデシュ、ネパール、

ヨーロッパ：イギリス、フランス、ドイツ、オランダ、ベルギー、フィンランド、スウェーデン、デンマーク

Human Rights Watch, *Broken People: Caste Violence against India's Untouchables*, 1999.

U.N. World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance (Durban), Aug.31-Sept.7, 2001.

初期のエピソードとしては、1982年、国連人権小委員会にて、Dr. Laxmi Berwa が証言、北アメリカの移民ダリト組織3つ(VISION, the Ambedkar Mission of Canada, the Shri Guru Ravidas Sabha in California) がスポンサー(Joshi, ed. 1986: 135-139) ただし、Rajshekar では Shri ...ではなく、Ambedkar Buddhist Council of United Kingdom が挙げられている

Rajshekar 1987[1979] の出版

アメリカ下院、イギリス議会での決議

\* 「ダリト資本主義」、民間部門(private sector)への留保制度拡大要求

・ここで問題とされるのは、民間企業であって「民間の」中小企業などでなし

Chandra Bhan Prasad アメリカのアファーマティブ・アクションを指標

Diversity というコンセプトの導入

“Advocacy of diversity has been my passion since 1996...”

(Prasad 2004: 238)

“A few Dalits as billionaires, a few hundred as multi-millionaires and a few thousand as millionaires would democratize and de-Indianize Capitalism. A few dozen Dalits as market speculators, a few Dalit-owned corporations traded on stock-exchanges, a few Dalits with private Jets, and a few of them with Golf caps, would make democratic Capitalism loveable”. (cited in Menon and Nigam 2007: 96)

・経緯概略(佐藤 2006)

ボーパール会議(2002年1月) MP 政府、ボーパール宣言 21項目の要求

2004年総選挙前夜

会議派：2003年7月シムラーでの州首相会議

人民党：ヴァージュペーイーによる発言、2003年12月16日

2004年5月成立の統一進歩連合(UPA) 政権の National Common Minimum Programme

同年8月末、留保問題を討議する閣僚グループ任命

⇒産業界からの反発表明 ex. バジヤージー・グループ

⇒アカデミアでも議論 ex. EPW, Seminar(2005年5月、no.549)

2005年8月8、9日 「民間部門における留保制度に関する全国サミット」

⇒デリー宣言

その他 C,ST 全国組織による Dalit International Conference(Vancouver,2003)

・経済外効果？

Cf. The arrival of other cultures in India will cause a big upheaval in the orthodox thinking here. It will change the caste system...

AM: So, you think cultural globalization can have a good impact?

ST: It can have a positive impact. It can change the Indian people. The entire belief system here needs to change. Because of globalization, we are becoming aware of democratic practices and of struggles for rights and entitlements from across the world. ....

AM: But there are arguments that globalization will reduce people's rights, entitlements and freedom.

ST: No, globalization is increasing, rather than decreasing people's rights and freedom. I feel that these people are saying the opposite because they are afraid that it will destroy Hindu culture. (Limble 2004: 128-9)

## II. ダリト文学をめぐって

\* 概観

ダリト作家たちの会議 1958年3月2日 (Limble 2004: 25)

little magazines

ダリト・パンサー(Murugkar 1991) マニフェスト 1973年 (Joshi 1986) に所収

ダリト文学の英語翻訳出版ラッシュ

‘Translation Revolution’ of the 1990s” (Ravikumar and Azhagarasan, 2012: xi).

＊組織

Bharatiya Dalit Sahitya Akademi (Indian Dalit Literary Academy), Delhi  
Center for Alternative Dalit Media  
Dalit Lekhak Sangh  
以上は (Breck 2008) いずれも 1995 年創設か

＊ダリト文学とは何か？ダリト文学を書くのは誰か？ダリト文学美学 aesthetics？

・「ダリト」自体の定義多様、問題

‘Narratives of pain’ (Beth 2007:549) ”Narratives of Suffering (Basu 2002)

“Dalit literature is literature in which dalits have depicted their own pain. It is literature that expresses the reality of what they have suffered in their struggle for the life.” (Naresh K. Jain による Valmiki 2008 への序文、p. 12.)

negation and protest, 同

“By Dalit literature, I mean writing about Dalits by Dalit writers with a Dalit consciousness.” (Limbale 2004:19) Cf. Indian Literature タミル・ダリト文学特集の序論 by Venkat Swaminathan,

・「女流」作家をめぐる議論との共通性

“I am not a Dalit writer, and I don’t want to be!” Kavidendra Indu

・言語

Cf. “Speak in your Tamil. Speak in your language that has been despised as *cheri* Tamil and colloquial Tamil!” (Ravikumar and Azhagarasan 2012:268)

・主体：個人ではなく、集団

\*It is as though the autobiographical ‘I’ does not have an autonomous life outside the collective ‘we’. (Pandian 1998:54) パーマの *Karukku* (1992) に関するもの

. \*My argument here is that dalit life narratives are in fact testimonies, which forge a right to speak both for and beyond the individual and contest explicitly or implicitly the ‘official forgetting’ of histories of caste oppression, struggles and resistance. (Rege 2006:13)

＊地域差 ex. タミル：反バラモン/タミル・ナショナリズム言説批判、ケーララ：左翼言説批判 (グジャラート：左翼の洗礼受けず、反留保アジテーション 1981 年)

＊ダリト文学英訳出版「ブーム」の問題性

### III. ダリト・フェミニズムとジェンダー研究

＊カーストとジェンダーの有機的連関への注目とダリト・フェミニズム

・ Gail Omvedt, “The Downtrodden among the Downtrodden” (Rao 2003) に所収オリジナルは Signs 4(4) Summer 1979)

・ Uma Chakrabarti, “Brahmanical patriarchy” (2003)

・ “.....women are the gateways of caste-system and the critical pivot on whose purity-sanctity axis the caste hierarchy is constructed. “(Jogdand 1995:4)

・ Gopal Guru, “Dalit Women Talk Differently”, (NFDW) 集会が背景 EPW, 14-21 Dec. 1995 (Rao 2003) に所収

＊Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) 1979 年国連総会で採択、1981 年発効 (Cf. 日本の締結 1985 年)

インド 1993 年批准 Review report におけるダリト女性への言及

＊組織と活動

Women’s Voice (Bangalore) Ruth Manorama ‘thrice alienated’ cited in (Dietrich 1992)

Cf. Gail Omvedt “downtrodden among the downtrodden” (Rao ed. 2003:321)

National Federation of Dalit Women (NFDW)、1995 年 8 月、デリー

National Federation of Dalit Women、バンガロール

All India Dalit Women’s Rights Forum、1994 (Rao 2003: 36)

Christi Mahila Sangharsh Sanghatana 1997 (Rege 2006:65)

Cf. 北京会議 (1995 年)

The Hague Declaration on the Human Rights and Dignity of Dalit Women, 21 Nov. 2006.

12 月 25 日 (アンベードカルが『マヌ法典』を焼いた日として有名) を、Bharatiya Stree Mukti Divas とするべきという提案 (Rege 2006:65) Meena Kandasamy によれば、Indian Association for Women’s Studies は祝い始めている、Teltumbde ed., 2005: 127)

新たな英語ジャーナル The Dalit 2002 年 (Rao 2003: 36) ?

Dalit Voice (Bangalore) 1981～ V.T.Rajashekar

＊フェミニズム、ジェンダー研究へのインプリケーション

“By using the term ‘dalit women’ we are creating an imaginary category. This imagining is necessary because we hope that Dalit women in the near future will give new critical dimensions to Indian feminist movement as well as to Dalit Movement”. (Jogdand 1995: 1) 強調はオリジナル 大文字、小文字の混在もオリジナル

おわりに

暴力の前景化 (ここにおいてダリト女性がもっとも頻繁に言及される?)

「ダリト・インテリ」の正統性

Robin Jeffrey, Nivedita Menon, Susie Tharu らによる序

サバルタン・スタディーズに所収されたイライヤ論文に関するチャクラボルティのコメント

異カースト間の婚姻は運動の柱となっているのか?

アンベードカル “The real remedy for breaking caste is inter-marriage.

Nothing else will serve as the solvent of caste.” Annihilation of Caste, 1936.

Cf. “In the war for equality, for ages and ages the endogamy prevailing in this society (in the Hindu society) has remained as the fortress that protects casteism. Intercaste marriage is a revolt against the system of marriage within the subcaste, i.e. endogamy.” Thirumaavalavan, 2004, p. 2.

さまざまなダリト/ダリトバフジャン定義、新自由主義経済への反応

ダリト運動における「ダリトと女」というカップリング議論(認識)、ただし、“our women” framework ((Jogdand 1995:4)へのプレも Cf. Viramm に関する Ravikumar の批判、(Gorringe 2005) などが指摘するような主張と実際とのギャップ。

地域的偏り←歴史社会的条件、ダリト・ミドルクラスの状況・価値の反映

2011 年カースト・センサス (カースト・BPL センサス)

“Our central point is that *not* counting caste has been one of independent India’s biggest mistakes.” (Deshpande and John, 2010) 強調は原文

「カースト」を公で論ずることを逆行とみなすこと、カーストの問題はOBCやダリトの問題とすることへの挑戦、異議申し立て

インド民主主義の動態と行方

新たな「近代性」→メモ①

いかにダリトの問題が論じられ、表象されているかを知らない多数のダリトの存在

→メモ②

フレール、アンペードカル (アッヤンカーリやアヨーティ・ダースなど) の絶対化の問題

#### 参考文献

石田英明「マラーティー文学と「ダリト文学」、白田雅之・押川文子・小谷汪之編『もっと知りたいインド』II (弘文堂、1989年)。

佐藤宏「インドの雇用問題における社会的次元：民間部門への雇用留保制度導入論争をめぐって」、佐藤宏編『南アジアにおけるグローバリゼーション：雇用・労働問題に対する影響』、アジア経済研究所、2006年。

Babu, D. Shyam and R.S. Khare eds., *Caste in Life: Experiencing Inequalities*, Delhi: Pearson, 2011.

Basu, Raj Sekhar, *Nandanar’s Children: The Paraiyans’ Tryst with Destiny, Tamil Nadu 1850-1956*, New Delhi: Sage, 2011.

Basu, Tapan, “Narratives of Suffering: Dalit Perspectives”, *Translating Caste*, New Delhi: Katha, 2002.

Beth, Sarah, “Hindi Dalit Autobiography: and Exploration of Identity”, *Modern Asian Studies*, 41(3), 2007, pp. 545-574.

Breck, Laura R. “Mainstreaming Marginalized Voices: The Dalit Lekhak Sangh and the Negotiations over Hindi Dalit Literature”, in Bhagavan, Manu and Anne Feldhaus, eds. *Claiming Power from Below: Dalits and the Subaltern Question in India*, New Delhi: OUP, 2008.

Chakrabarti, Uma, *Gendering Caste: Through a Feminist Lens*, Kolkata: Samya, 2003.

Constable, Philip, “Early Dalit Literature and Culture in Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth-Century Western India”, *Modern Asian Studies*, 31(2), 1997, 00. 317-338.

Deshpande, Satish and Mary E. John, “The Politics of Not Counting Caste,” *EPW*, 45(25), 2010, in Japhet, S. and Chandan Gowda eds. *Caste Census Towards an Inclusive India*, Centre for the Study of Social Exclusion and Inclusive Policy, National Law School of India University, Bangaluru, 2010.

Dietrich, Gabriele, *Reflections on the Women’s Movement: Religion, Ecology, Development*, New Delhi: Horizon India Books, 1992.

Franco, Fernando, Jyotsna Macwan and Suguna Ramanathan, eds., *The Silken Swing: The Cultural Universe of Dalit Women*, Kolkata: Stree, 2000.

Franco, Fernando, Jyotsna Macwan and Suguna Ramanathan, *Journeys to Freedom: Dalit Narratives*, Kolkata: Samya, 2004.

Gorringe, Hugo, *Untouchable Citizens: Dalit Movements and Democratisation in Tamil Nadu*, New Delhi: Sage, 2005.

Grey, Mary C. *A Cry for Dignity: Religion, Violence and the Struggle of Dalit Women in India*, London: Equinox, 2010.

Hardtmann, Eva-Maria, *The Dalit Movement in India: Local Practices, Global Connections*, New Delhi: OUP, 2009.

Irudayam S.J., Aloysius, Jayshree P. Mangubhi and Joel G. Lee, eds. *Dalit Women Speak Out: Violence against Dalit Women in India*, vol. II, Caste Narratives (Detailed), National Campaign on Dalit Human Rights, National Federation of Dalit Women, Institute of Development Education, Action and Studies, 2006.

Jogdand, P.G. *Dalit Women in India: Issues and Perspectives*, New Delhi: Gyan Publishing House, 1995. フレーへの献辞、1993年9月開催ブネー大学女性学センターの二日間のセミナー・ペーパー

Joshi, Barbara R. ed., *Untouchable!: Voice of the Dalit Liberation Movement*, London: Zed Books, 1986.

Kothari, Rita, “Short Story in Gujarati Dalit Literature”, *EPW*, Nov. 10, 2001, pp. 4308-4311.

Limbale, Sharankumar, *Towards an Aesthetic of Dalit Literature: History, Controversies and Considerations*, translated from the Marathi by Alok Mukherjee, Hyderabad: Orient Longman, 2004[1996]

Menon, Nivedita, ed., *Sexualities* (Issues in Contemporary Indian Feminism 5), New Delhi: Women Unlimited, 2007.

Menon, Nivedita and Aditya Nigam, *Power and Contestation: India since 1989*, Hyderabad: Orient Longman, 2007.

Murugkar, Lata *Dalit Panther Movement in Maharashtra: A Sociological Appraisal*, Bombay: Popular Prakashan, 1991

Nagaraj, D.R., *The Flaming Feet and Other Essays: The Dalit Movement in India*,

London-Seagull Books, 2010[1993].

Natarajan, Balmurli and Paul Greenough, eds., *Against Stigma: Studies in Caste, Race and Justice since Durban*, Hyderabad: Orient BlackSwan, 2009.

Pandian, M. S. M. "On a dalit woman's testimonio", *Seminar*, 471, 1998, pp. 53-56.

Do.. "Stepping Outside History?: New Tamil Dalit Writings in Tamil Nadu" in Partha Chatterjee, ed., *Wages of Freedom: Fifty Years of the Indian Nation-State*, New Delhi: OUP, 1998, pp. 292-309.

Prasad, Chandra Bhan, *Dalit Diary: 1999-2003 Reflections on Apartheid in India*, New Delhi: Navayana, 2004.

Do., *Dalit Phobia: Why Do They Hate Us?* New Delhi: Vitasta Publishing, 2006.

Rajawat, Mamta ed. *Dalit Women: Issued and Perspective*, New Delhi: Anmol Publications, 2005.

Rajshekar, V.T. Dalit: *The Black Untouchables of India*, Atlanta/Ottawa: Clarity Press, 1987 (オリジナル・タイトルは *Apartheid in India*, 1979).

Rao, Anupama, ed., *Gender & Caste* (Issues in Contemporary Indian Feminism 1), New Delhi: Kali for Women, 2003.

Rawat, Ramnarayan S., *Reconsidering Untouchability: Chamars and Dalit History in North India*, Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2011.

Rege Sharmila, "Debating the Consumption of Dalit 'Autobiographies': The Significance of Dalit 'Testimonios'", in *Writing Caste/Writing Gender: Narrating Dalit Women's Testimonios*, New Delhi: Zubaan, 2006.

Sabharwal, Nidhi Sadana, *Dalit Women Rights and Citizenship in India*, New Delhi: Indian Institute of Dalit Studies, 2010.

Satyanarayana, A. "Ideology and Consciousness of Dalit-Bahujans in Colonial Andhra: Mid Nineteenth to Mid Twentieth Century", in Sabyasachi Bhattacharya ed., *Development of Modern Indian Thought and the Social Sciences*, OUP, 2007, pp. 187-219.

Teltumbde, Anand, *Khairlanji: A Strange and Bitter Crop*, New Delhi: Navayana, 2008.

Do. eds. *Hindutva and the Dalits*, Kolkata: Samya, 2005.

Thorat, Sukhadeo, and Aryama and Prashant Negi, eds. *Reservation and Private Sector: Quest for Equal Opportunity and Growth*, Jaipur: Rawat Publications, 2007 (first pub. 2005, New Delhi: Indian Institute of Dalit Studies).

Zelliot, Eleanor, "Stri Dalit Sahitya: The New Voice of Women Poets", in Anne Feldhaus, ed., *Images of Women in Maharashtrian Literature and Religion*, Albany: State University of New York Press, 1996.

ダリト文学・評論・スピーチ・聞き取り (英語翻訳) Jadav(2003)を除く

Anand, Mulk Raj and Eleanor Zelliot eds., *An Anthology of Dalit Literature*, New Delhi: Gyan Publishing House, 1992.

Bama, *Sangati: Events*, translated from Tamil by Lakshmi Holmstrom, New Delhi: OUP,

2005[1994].

Bama, *Vanmam: Vendetta*, translated from Tamil by Malini Seshadri, New Delhi: OUP, 2008[2002]. Karukku [1992]未読

Dangle, Arjun eds., *Poisoned Bread: Translations from Modern Marathi Dalit Literature*, Hyderabad: Orient Longman, 1992.

Dasan. A, V. Pratibha, Pradeepan Pampirilunnu and C.S.Chandrika eds., *The Oxford India Anthology of Malayalam Dalit Writing*, New Delhi: OUP, 2012.

Gunasekaran, K. A. *The Scar*, translated from the Tamil by V. Kadambari, Hyderabad: Orient Blackswan, 2009[2005]

Imayam, *Beast of Burden*, Translated from Tamil by Lakshmi Holmström, Madras: MANAS, 2001[1994].

Jadhav, Narenra, *Outcaste: a Memoir*, New Delhi: Viking, 2003[1993 Marathi, 2002 French].

Kamble, Baby, *The Prisons We Broke*, translated from the Marathi by Maya Pandit, Hyderabad: Orient Longman, 2008[1986].

Kesharshivam, B. *The Whole Truth and Nothing but the Truth: A Dalit's Life*, translated from the Gujarati by Gita Chaudhuri, Kolkata: Samya, 2008[2002].

Limbale, Sharankumar, *The Outcaste: Akkarmashi*, translated from Marathi by Santosh Bhoomkar, Delhi: OUP, 2003[1984].

Do. *Hindu: A Novel*. Translated from the Marathi by Arun Prabha Mukherjee, Kolkata: Samya, 2010[2003].

Macwan, Joseph, *The Stepchild: Angaliyat*, translated from Gujarati by Rita Kothari, New Delhi: OUP, 2004[1987 ? 1988 ?]. (Franco, Macwan and Ramanathan, 2004.)の Chap.3)は作者のインタビューがもとになっている

Malagatti, Aravind, *Government Brahman*, translated from the Kannada by Dharani Devi Malagatti, Janet Vucinich, and N. Subramanya, Hyderabad: Orient Longman, 2007[1994].

Moon, Vasant, *Growing Up Untouchable in India: A Dalit Autobiography*, translated from the Marathi by Gail Omvedt, Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield, 2001.

Pawar, Urmila, *The Weave of My Life: A Dalit Woman's Memoirs*, translated from the Marathi by Maya Pandit, Kolkata: Stree, 2008[2003].

Pawar, Urmila and Meenakshi Moon, *We Also Made History: Women in the Ambedkarite Movement*, trans. by Wsmdana Sonalkar, New Delhi: Zubaan, 2008[2006].

Ravikumar, *Venomous Touch: Notes on Caste, Culture and Politics*, translated from the Tamil by R. Azhagarasan, Kolkata: Samya, 2009.

Ravikumar and R. Azhagarasan eds., *The Oxford India Anthology of Tamil Dalit Writing*, New Delhi: OUP, 2012.

Rege Sharmila, ed., *Writing Caste/Writing Gender: Narrating Dalit Women's Testimonios*, New Delhi: Zubaan, 2006.



Satyanarayana, K. and Susie Tharu eds., *No Alphabet in Sight: New Dalit Writing from South India*, Dossier 1, Tamil and Malayalam, New Delhi: Penguin, 2011.

Sivakami, P. *The Grip of Change*, translated from the Tamil by the author, Hyderabad: Orient Blackswan, 2006[1989].

Srilata, K. ed. and trans. *The Other Half of the Coconut: Women Writing Self-Respect History: An Anthology of Self-Respect Literature (1928-1936)*, New Delhi: Kali for Women, 2003.

Thirumaavalavan, *Talisman: Extreme Emotions of Dalit Liberation*, translated from the Tamil by Meena Kandasamy, Kolkata: Samya, 2004.

Do. *Uproot Hindutva: The Fiery Voice of the Liberation Panthers*, translated from the Tamil by Meena Kandasamy, Kolkata: Samya, 2004.

Valmiki, Omprakash, *Joothan: An Untouchable's Life*, translated from the Hindi by Arun Prabha Mukherjee, New York: Columbia University Press, 2003[1997].

Do., *Amma and Other Stories*, Translation and Introduction Naresh K. Jain, Delhi: Manohar, 2008.

*Indian Literature* のダリト文学特集

No. 59 (Jan.-Feb. 1994) Gujarati

No. 189(May-June 1998) Punjabi

No. 193(Sept.-Oct. 1999) Tamil

メモ

- ① This (フレー、アンベードカルの)modernity was different from what Joshi(2001) has called the fractured modernity of the middle classes, which can be described in shorthand as a stitching together of brahmanical and new ideas. Dalit modernity, on the other hand, was fashioned by a stitching together of the emancipatory materialistic traditions that challenged Brahmanism and new western ideas (Guru 2000). (Rege 2006: 32)
- ② She (Omvedt) 'I'll write something worth reading and writing, but it will be in thin small letters and we won't be able to read it, so at all, there will be no profit or loss to us. [General laughter.] Is this true or false? Bai, is what I am saying a mistake? Understand, we show our difficulties to you, you send from there some paper and some educated person will read, some children, and we know nothing, whatever they tell us or explain to us, we will understand. If we even have the time. (Rao 2003: 314)

